Did Cash for Work (CFW) Program promote recovery from 311 disasters?

Shingo NAGAMATSU, Ph.D.
Faculty of Safety Science,
Kansai University
Emergency Job Generation Program

Operating community FM radio station (Minami Soma)

Cart sales in the temporary housing villages (Soma)

Visiting individual residents every morning and evening to check if they are fine (Tagajo)

Managing aid supplies in warehouse (Higashi-Matsushima)

Returning albums to the original owners (Kesennuma)
Similarity with Cash for Work (CFW)

Advantages:

1) Empowers the disaster affected people (GTZ, 2009)
2) Promote disaster recovery projects (Myammer Red Cross, 2009)
3) Encourages people participating in recovery (Mercy Corps, 2008)
4) Stimulates local economy (Mercy Corps, 2008; GTZ, 2009)
5) Encouraging self-targeting(Mercy Corps, 2008)
Evaluation of CFW program in Japan

1. Unemployment reduction
2. Promoting disaster recovery projects
3. Providing variety of work contents
4. Promoting emotional satisfaction of the workers
1. Unemployment reduction

20% of jobs were generated by CFW

Figure 1: Ratio of employment sustained by government policy: March 2011 to March 2013. (Source: MHLW)
1. Unemployment reduction

Rapid boom in labor market in two years subsequent to the disaster

Figure 2: Job to applicant ratio: Mar. 2011 to Sep. 2014. (Source: MHLW)
3. Provision of variety type of work

Few manual labor, not like traditional CFW.

Fig. 3. Types of work assignment in the Kizuna project (N = 845).
3. Provision of variety type of work

Workers’ job experiences were respected to certain degree

Fig. 4. Work experience prior to the Nuclear power plant accident (N = 868).
4. Promoting emotional satisfaction of the workers

1. My sense of solidarity with other disaster victims has grown.
2. I have become more attached to Fukushima.
3. Through my work, I feel that I am supporting disaster victims to become self reliant.
4. The work has given me hope for the future.
5. Temporary housing complexes and local communities which receive support through my work have become vitalized.
6. I can support disaster victims without hesitation precisely because I am one myself.
7. Being a disaster victim myself, I am better able to understand the need for support of other disaster victims.
8. In my work, I am appreciated by disaster victims and other people.
9. The disaster victims are less reticent to receive support knowing that it is through the Kizuna project.
10. The Kizuna project is successful in tying up with local self-initiatives such as neighborhood associations and local self-governing bodies.
11. Others understand that, although I am employed by the Kizuna project, I am a disaster victim myself.
12. I can listen to other people’s experiences of the disaster as part of the work, without getting emotionally caught up.
13. I can view matters concerning the privacy of acquaintances as part of the work, without getting emotionally caught up.

Figure 6. Workers’ emotional satisfaction with Kizuna project (N = 894)
Targeting

- Targeting of CFW is a big challenge.
- *Self-targeting*: Wage rate of CFW program be set 20%-30% lower level than normal market rate (Mercy Corps, 2007).
- Self targeting is often impossible since the workers cannot earn enough to meet basic needs (Harvey, 2007).
- CFW in Haiti benefitted less to families headed by women and families with disabled person (Echevin, 2011).
40% of the workers rely on their jobs as main income source.

Fig. 3. Highest income earner of household currently in Kizuna Project (N = 894).
CFW encouraged the affected who lost their houses to become a workforce.

Figure 6 Average days of being unemployed prior to current job, by age.

Figure 7 Average days of being unemployed prior to current job, by dwelling.
Most of the CFW workers do not have dependent family member.

Fig. Number of dependent families.
Conclusion

• CFW can be a powerful tool for promoting disaster recovery.

• However, targeting of CFW can not be necessarily successful:
  – Wage rate may not be enough to raise dependent family members.
  – Families who have young family members may have emigrated from the disaster area.
Policy Recommendation

- CFW can be universal tools for disaster recovery.
- Experiences in Japan have several significant lessons;
  - PPP would be effective for successful job matching.
  - CFW can encourage the affected people to become workforce.
  - Self-targeting approach is not recommendable: it may cause emigration of the affected people from disaster area.