Surges and Swarms

A Conversation on Responsible Coverage of Migration

*Highlights from a Workshop with the News Media in the Context of
UN Consultations on the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration*

Bellagio, Italy — October, 2017

UNITED NATIONS UNIVERSITY

UNU-GCM
Institute on Globalization,
Culture and Mobility

UNITED NATIONS UNIVERSITY

UNU-CPR
Centre for Policy Research

Authors[1]
Dr. Rebecca Brubaker, Senior Policy Adviser, UNU-CPR
Prof. Parvati Nair, Director, UNU-GCM

*The Bellagio Workshop was organized and convened by
the United Nations University Institute on Globalization,
Culture and Mobility (UNU-GCM)*

Cover Image
Evros, Greece May, 2018 — Several families from Syria
walk down a stretch of dirt road after having crossed the
Turkish border. The families walk into the sunset where
at a Greek detention center, they will seek asylum. The
number of people crossing the border from Turkey to
Greece has increased threefold over the last month.
The Turkish/Greek land border is not covered by the
2016 agreement between Turkey and the EU to restrict
migrant movement into Europe.

Photo copyright: UNU-GCM/Gregory Beals, 2018.
All images within this report can be attributed to Gregory
Beals. The authors thank Gregory Beals for collaboration.
Gregory Beals is a journalist, humanitarian and political
analyst who has followed the lives of survivors of conflict
for the past 18 years. His writings and photographs have
appeared in several major news outlets, including the
Guardian and Al Jazeera.

There [is] a consensus that migration reporting is one of the biggest challenges facing the news media and will be for years to come. It is essential that media rise to the challenge of covering migration and put ethics at the centre of their coverage.

Tom Law, Ethical Journalism Network

Mafikeng, South Africa May, 2018. Twins Trading Store in Mafikeng in South Africa's North West Province was looted and burned on April 20, 2018 during riots protesting alleged corruption against the regional premier. An estimated 1,000 people were forced out of communities after looters targeted foreign-owned stores.

Overview

In October 2017, representatives from international news media networks, academia and the United Nations (UN) met to discuss the role of the media in shaping public opinion on migration. The event was organized by the United Nations University Institute on Globalization, Culture and Mobility (UNU-GCM) against the backdrop of the United Nations University's Chairmanship of the United Nations Global Migration Group (GMG), an extension of the University's effort to support Member State negotiations towards a Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration in 2018.[2] Prior to the Workshop, a research report on *Addressing Xenophobia: Representations of Migration and the Role of the Media* was prepared by UNU-GCM and circulated to stimulate discussion (hereafter "Addressing Xenophobia").

Over the course of 2017, a series of thematic consultations were organized to feed into the drafting of the Global Compact on Migration. During these consultations, Member States solicited input from a diverse range of stakeholders, including civil society, the private sector, academia, and UN entities. The international news media were invited to cover many of these consultations, but were not formally included.[3] The Bellagio Workshop was organized to provide a space for representatives of the news media, UN personnel and academic experts to discuss the media's role in representing migrants and shaping public attitudes towards migration. Recommendations from this workshop will be available to the UN system, Member States negotiating the global compact on migration and to the public.

The Workshop in Bellagio was guided by two key questions: How do the international news media represent migrants and refugees? And how do the media's choices of representation influence public opinion about who migrants are, what they want, and the rights they should or should not have? These questions were considered with a spotlight on the 2015 European "migrant crisis" and the ensuing discussions offered a rare insight into how UN migration advocates view the responsibilities of international newsmakers, and concurrently, how newsmakers and news producers see their own responsibilities in this sphere. It also allowed academic experts on the nexus of media and migration to offer insights into how the media operates as part of the social environment that affects all concerned. Moreover, the event provided a unique opportunity to build awareness between advocates and newsmakers on "good practices," common challenges, and areas for collaboration. The following summary highlights takeaways from this event and identifies a series of policy recommendations that emerged from the discussions.

Mayfair, Johannesburg, South Africa, May 2018.
Osman Dahir, age 50 from Somalia had his spinal chord severed during an outbreak of xenophobic violence in 2015. Several days after the attack his adopted son, was murdered in a similar attack. "These people, they don't want foreigners," he said.

Alexandroupolis, Greece, May 2018. A table filled with items found on the bodies of those who have perished attempting to cross from Turkey into Greece. The dead not only include Syrians but also those of other nationalities.

Background

On September 19th 2016, all Member States of the United Nations agreed to the "New York Declaration," which set out a new vision for international cooperation around the rights and protections of refugees and migrants. The Declaration called for the adoption of two Global Compacts, one on refugees and one for migrants.[4] In Annex 2 of this Declaration, UN Member States unanimously commit to "Combating racism, xenophobia, discrimination and intolerance towards all migrants." Thematic consultations conducted in the lead up to the two global compacts cited the importance of the role of the media in achieving this commitment.

The Secretary-General showed his support for this Member State initiative by launching the *Together Campaign*, in collaboration with the UN system. One of the principal aims of the campaign is to "change negative perceptions and attitudes towards refugees and migrants."[5] This campaign commits the UN to work in partnership with Member States, the private sector and civil society. Representatives from this campaign, who attended the Bellagio Workshop, spoke to the importance of partnering with the media to achieve the Campaign's goals.

Case Study: Representing the 2015 "Migrant Crisis" in the Mediterranean region

While the media plays an important role in representing migrants and refugees globally, one of the primary issues discussed over the course of the workshop was the international media's coverage of the recent "migrant crisis" in Europe. In 2015, the number of individuals fleeing persecution, generalized conflict and economic hardship and seeking to enter Europe from the eastern and southern Mediterranean doubled compared to 2014.[6] This phenomenon gave rise to three challenges for major news outlets. First, what should they call the phenomenon of the rise in people seeking to enter the European Union; second, how should they label the people; and third, how should they represent the people behind the label? On the first challenge: how to describe the phenomenon, most media outlets settled on "crisis" and relied on the terms "flood," "wave" or "deluge" to connote the scale.[7] Other outlets controversially echoed UK Prime Minister Cameron or French far right politician Jean-Marie Le Pen's references to "swarms" and "barbarian invasions," adding a sense of danger and chaos to the emerging phenomenon.[8] A few outlets, such as the British tabloid *The Sun*, reverted to overtly racist commentary, likening the new arrivals to an infestation of resilient cockroaches, resistant to fumigation.[9]

While this string of analogies captured readers' attention and evoked strong emotions, they also often misrepresented the scale of the phenomenon and failed to place it in the appropriate context. For example, migrants make up only about three percent of the world's population, while refugees make up only 0.3 percent.[10] Increases in migration have more or less kept pace with increases in the global population over the last 45 years.[11] Similarly, while the number of individuals seeking to enter Europe may have doubled in 2015, 84 percent of refugees worldwide are hosted in a small handful of developing countries, not by countries in Europe.[12] In other words, in the global context of migration and refugee flows, the individuals that sought to reach Europe in 2015 represented neither a deluge nor a flood, but rather a stream.

Moreover, the news media's tendency to focus on scale at the expense of personalized stories also contributed to the dehumanization of the "masses on the move."[13] As one BBC reporter put it: "What we are hearing on our radios and seeing on our screens are images and sounds that portray the volume of people. And the way to dehumanize them is just to [concentrate on volume]. And the way to keep them as human beings … is to talk to them. To hear their stories as individuals, as opposed to as part of a trend."[14]

In 2015, major news outlets faced a second challenge: how to label the individuals seeking to enter Europe? The most common labels included "migrant," "asylum seeker" and "refugee." Each of these three labels, however, implies different obligations on the part of the international community and the receiving state and thus should not be arbitrarily applied.[15] Given the heterogeneity of the flows, how were newsmakers to label those within them?

In addition, news outlets also had to grapple with shifting definitions attached to common labels. Against the backdrop of the "crisis" and the rise of anti-immigrant sentiment across Europe, common

Alexandroupolis, Greece, May 2018. Medical Examiner Pavlidis Pavlos holds a necklace found on the body of a man who had drowned in the Evros River attempting to pass between Greece and Turkey. The inscription on the pendant reads "Heart for you." He keeps the items stored in a box in order to help relatives identify the bodies.

labels – such as refugee and migrant – acquired new, pejorative social meanings.[16] As a result, some media outlets took an official stance on which labels they would and would not use, no matter the dictionary or legal definitions. *Al Jazeera*, for example, ceased using the term 'migrant' in their coverage of the crisis as they felt the term "dehumanized and distanced" the subjects of their coverage, and, as a result, made their stories easier to dismiss.[17] Instead, *Al Jazeera* contended, why not just call them "people"? Other outlets, in contrast, insisted on using "migrant" as a means of reclaiming the term from those who would use it pejoratively.[18] Without a common vocabulary to describe those seeking to enter the EU, many media outlets became caught in the political fray.

The third challenge, against the backdrop of the 2015 European "crisis," was perhaps the most challenging: how should the international news media represent the individuals behind the label? Some opted for statistics and others for personal narratives. Some reported from the point of arrival while others sought migrants out along their journey.[19] A few journalists returned to the point of origin to gather information on the conditions that had caused so many to leave.[20] Depending upon which approach was used, a very different story emerged concerning a person's or group's interests and needs.

Yet short, fast-paced reports dominated the news cycle, often (both inadvertently and purposefully) reinforcing tropes of migrants or refugees as 'profiteers' or 'terrorists' on the one hand or 'victims' and larger-than-life 'heroes' on the other.[21] The prominence of these narratives left little space for the complex humanity of the individuals to emerge, and, as a result, reinforced a narrative of difference between them and the host population.

Actions taken by the international community in light of the 2015 "migrant crisis"

The rise in news media coverage of migration in 2015 was accompanied by a rise in xenophobia and anti-immigration feeling in Europe and other common migrant destination countries.[22] A range of factors, including irresponsible news media coverage, were cited as contributing to the rise in xenophobia.[23] Some of the other factors included post-2008 austerity programs, rising Islamophobia, a series of attacks by ISIS and Al Qaida operatives

of both national and foreign birth, and the increasing reliance on social media for news consumption.[24] In this context, it became clear that a global response, to encourage safe, orderly and regular migration flows, was required.

As the United Nations and its Member States work in 2018 towards negotiating a Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular Migration, xenophobia remains an issue of concern. The news media industry plays a major role in determining how this problem is addressed.

Five Characteristics of News Coverage on Migrants and Refugees

There are generally five characteristics that need to be considered when analysing the international news media's depictions of migrants and refugees; these aspects include: 1) the (in)visibility of groups in news coverage, 2) the type of themes addressed, 3) the accuracy of the information provided, 4) the words and discursive techniques used to describe migrants, and 5) the images and pictures employed to document migration stories.[25] Studies have demonstrated a tendency on the part of Western news media to underreport positive stories and over report negative stories.[26] Highlighting another link between news coverage and growing xenophobia, other studies have found that often coverage associates migrants explicitly with negative themes such as criminality, security concerns, and economic competition or scarcity, reinforcing negative associations with the label.[27] Information at times also lacks accuracy, appropriate context or framing.[28] Other studies illustrate the prevalence of pejorative or dehumanizing words, narratives, or photos in Western news media coverage of migration.[29] While there is some evidence of trends shifting towards more nuanced or positive reporting, the general tilt of reporting, according to a recent study by the International Organization for Migration, is towards scepticism and suspicion and produces twice as much negative coverage on migration as positive.[30]

Effect of Media Coverage on Public Attitudes towards Migration

Over the course of the 2015 European 'migrant crisis,' the choices of media outlets, combined with other factors, shaped the attitudes of European citizens and played an important role in national-level politics.[31] In some cases, overestimations of the scale of migration played into public alarmism

and xenophobic rhetoric.[32] In others, depictions of migrants moving in large masses reinforced perceptions that new arrivals would pose an economic burden on the host community. Conversely, longitudinal coverage, individual profiles, reporting by migrants and refugees, think pieces that fact-checked political rhetoric or provided broader context, and reporting on the countries of origin all helped counteract misinformation campaigns and build critical awareness.[33]

Social media, its interactions with major news outlets and mediatised social environments

The global media landscape is complex and multi-layered. Mainstream media outlets co-exist and overlap in multiple ways with social media, which offers platforms for a great multiplicity of voices, online community formations and networks. It is important to recognise, therefore, that the 'media,' understood as mainstream new outlets that work alongside, in tandem with and against social media, has a broad and constantly evolving spectrum. Social media offers outlets for multiple voices and must be seen as part of the

Sidiro, Greece, May 2018. The Muslim dead are brought to a cemetery inthe village of Sidiro, which has about 430 inhabitants. There, they are laid to rest, mostly in unmarked graves. Pavlidis Pavlos, the Alexandroupolis medical examiner who performs autopsies on the dead, says that he occasionally receives telephone calls from family members seeking to return their bodies or at least pay tribute to them. Local residents worry that if the trends of migrant deaths continue, the number migrants resting in the local cemetery will soon outstrip the village population itself.

providing the elements that are in short supply and are likely to become even scarcer. In UN migrant and refugee advocates' efforts to report *their news* and the international media's efforts to report the news, there is certainly space for overlap, especially as both communities come under mounting pressure to deliver on their respective mandates in increasingly hostile climates.

Limits to cooperation

There are clear limits, however, to the degree to which these two communities – refugee and migrant advocates within the UN system and members of the news media – can and should cooperate. It is not the job of the media to be UN communications officers. Rather it is their job to "report the facts," no matter whether these facts paint the subject in a positive, negative, neutral or contradictory light. The moment media consumers perceive newsmakers to be mouthpieces for the UN, media organizations will lose their credibility and, with it, their ability to do their job. As one journalist reflected: "reputation is the only currency we have in this industry. The moment that is lost, I can no longer do my job." The Bellagio Workshop provided UN representatives with the chance to clarify that the *New York Declaration*, the *Together Campaign* and the *Global Compact for Migrants* are not asking the media to produce selective, imbalanced, misleading positive features. Rather these initiatives are calling on newsmakers and producers to partner in efforts to ensure that fact-based, accurate and human-centred reporting of this issue remains the gold standard.[40]

Examples of Responsible Coverage of Migrants in a Climate of Growing Xenophobia

A range of examples of responsible coverage of migrants in a climate of growing xenophobia were presented at the Bellagio workshop:

- On longitudinal coverage, participants cited BBC 4's 25-episode podcast series, which follows a middleclass Syrian family along its precarious journey from Turkey to Germany.[41]
- Participants discussed *Time Magazine's* year-long coverage of three refugee families and their new-born babies in a special series entitled "Finding Home" as an excellent case of an individual profile.[42]
- For coverage that provides pertinent context, participants highlighted *The Guardian's* "The Long Read." As part of the "slow news movement," *The Guardian* now devotes a section of its coverage to long form pieces that teach readers more about a topic rather than just giving them the headlines.[43]
- The US's National Public Radio's show, *This American Life*, dedicated an hour long episode to describing the challenges and the benefits of hosting refugees in small town America.[44] It highlighted the risks associated with misinformation and the paucity of fact-checked political claims from those advocating and those opposing hosting more refugees.
- The specialized news site, *Refugees Deeply*, allotted sections of its coverage to refugee journalists, as well as to the conflicts from which individuals have fled, in order to help its readers better understand why someone, such as Alan Kurdi's father, would feel compelled to risk his son's life attempting to cross the Aegean.[45]

Beirut, Lebanon May 2018. El Hadi Abdullah al Doma Ishak age 31 lives with two others in a small room in Beirut's Hamra area. For several years after fleeing Darfur in Sudan, he was essentially made to work as an indentured servant in Khartoum. He left Sudan in 2010 by air. I went direct to Syria. "They told me that was the way to get to Greece. I stayed in Damascus for two days. Then they took us to a farm in Syria. Then they took me to a mountain. 'Greece is on the other side of that mountain,' they told me. We walked for about 8 hours. From there we arrived to a small village. I don't remember the name. At the village others took me to a small room. 'Do you speak Arabic?' the man asked. I told him yes. He said 'Welcome to Lebanon.' They told me they would take me to a place called Beirut and that it was safe there."

"Please show my picture to everyone," he says. "Maybe my family will see it and know where I am."

- Finally, a photographer from Magnum turned his lens from focusing on migrants to focusing on what migrants may want to see; he created a book about Europe to serve as a guide to its newcomers.[46] The book included, among other things, a helpful chronicle of the origins of the EU, photos and personal testimonials of Europeans who had lived through war and displacement, as well as practical information on the most popular countries of destination.[47]

All of these examples follow general guidelines for newsmakers and news producers outlined in the *Addressing Xenophobia* report, recommended by the Ethical Journalism Network and cited in general guidelines for reporting on migration.[48]

Conclusion

The 2017 Workshop in Bellagio provided an important opportunity to explore the role of the media in representing migrants. The three days of discussion concluded with a far richer appreciation of the challenges faced by the media industry and those who work in it. The workshop also shed much light on what the term 'news media' actually refers to. The Workshop also revealed where the principles of the media practitioners can collide with and where they complement those of migrant and refugee advocates within the UN. As one participant summed up, "these two communities have incredibly different cultures ... We report. They advocate. But our interests can often align. And when they do, the outcome is better for everyone."

Kampong Chhnang, Cambodia June, 2018. Borders are not boundaries so much as shared cultural and political myths. The same can be said for the idea of citizenship. In Cambodia, for example, people who may have been born and grown up in the country but whose ethnicity is Vietnamese are widely considered not to be Cambodian citizens. To be Cambodian is to be Khmer. And so Dien, 40 who was born and raised in the Cambodian province of Kampong Chhnang, along the Tonle Sap river, a tributary of the Mekong river has a visa card for Cambodia but no citizenship. And while she have visited Vietnam before in her life, she does not consider herself at all to be Vietnamese. She works with her niece, Diep, who is 23 years of age. Like many people born and raised in Cambodia of Vietnamese decent, the family makes their living catching fish along the river, then selling them to passers by. Khmers and Vietnamese work alongside each other along the river banks, but still there is a clear idea of who belongs to the heart of the nation and who does not. I ask her if since she is considered to be Vietnamese, if Vietnam is her real country. "I want to stay in Cambodia," she tells me. "But only the king can make me a citizen."

Annex 1

Policy Recommendations Drawn from the Bellagio Workshop and the Addressing Xenophobia report [49]

Recommendations for United Nations entities:

- Invite input from the media in the negotiation process on the Global Compact for Safe, Orderly and Regular migration and the Global Compact on Refugees.

- Engage journalists, representatives of media organizations, media regulators, and the communication services of organizations closely working with migrant groups to discuss the role that the media can play in countering xenophobic representations of migration.

- Include the media in the implementation of the eventual global compact (to be formally adopted in December 2018) as one of the "relevant actors in migration governance." (GC/M, Art. 13, para. 11).

- Organize more workshops for journalists globally as new situations arise, ensuring the media has access to frequently updated, accurate and easily digestible information as well as vulnerable populations, when appropriate.

- UN entities should explore collaborative reporting projects with media experts to facilitate responsible, nuanced, balanced, and human-centred reporting. The UN, concerned NGOs and Member States should be ready to support such initiatives with funding.

- UN efforts should focus not just on media producers but also on media consumers. Building critical awareness on how to read and evaluate news sources, seek differing opinions, and cross check facts is even more important in a media landscape increasingly dominated by social media and 'fake news'.

- Consider calling out media outlets or specific reporters, organizations or companies when they are engaging in or enabling reporting that constitutes hate speech, includes gross misrepresentations or puts individuals in danger.

- Encourage coverage of the situations from which individuals are fleeing in order to increase understanding of the circumstances that would prompt someone to take such a precarious journey.

Recommendations for Newsmakers:

- Avoid stereotyped, pejorative and homogenizing vocabulary when representing refugees and migrants in the news. Ensure that coverage of migrants and refugees goes beyond the otherwise overused tropes of 'profiteers', 'victims', 'heroes' or 'terrorists'. Instead, report the news with sufficient context and in a way that helps readers understand the nuance and complexity of categories and individual cases. Such reporting will help build understanding and readers' ability to more critically engage with and evaluate information on migration in order to form their own opinions. [50]

- Ensure diverse and representative coverage of migrant groups within each country so as to offer a voice to a wide array of migrants and inform the public about the composition of the migrant population of their country. To this end, diversify sources of information cited in news coverage by offering more space to migrants and individuals working directly with migrant groups.

- Keep exploring stories relating to migrant journeys, everyday living conditions, skills or contributions to host societies rather than only focusing on migrant arrivals or border crossings and on the impact of migrant group admissions on employment levels, security conditions and national identities, which are also important, but not the only effects to be considered.

- Explain, or, when in doubt, seek clarification from scholars or the relevant UN entity or government on statistics on migrants' admissions and integration in order to avoid misinterpretations and possible discriminatory practices; for instance, the number of migrants admitted in a country in a given year could be presented as percentages of the total population rather than absolute numbers and it could be compared to other countries to provide richer context.

Recommendations for Media Regulators:

- Assess how effectively journalists implement media regulation on migration by, for instance, adjudicating complaints sent by the public to press councils regarding discriminatory migration coverage.

- Systematically include reporting guidelines on migration and migrant groups in codes of ethics, codes of practice or codes of conduct.

- Develop specific reporting guidelines on Islamophobia and hatred toward Muslims.

- Survey existing projects – whether undertaken by unions of journalists, registered charities, international organizations, universities or other types of organizations that aim at providing analysis on migration coverage, countering xenophobia and promoting ethical representations of migration, monitor their implementation and assess their impact.

Recommendations for Member State Governments:

- Provide funding to organizations that analyze media reporting on migration.

- Encourage the development of ethical journalistic practices towards migrants, such as conferences, workshops, training activities and sensitization campaigns.

- Raise public awareness of the different forms of discrimination towards migrants on the one hand, and on the ways to access, use, analyze and assess the media on the other.

- Support media organizations directed by ethnic and minority groups, especially when they raise awareness about the situation of migrants.

Annex 2

List of participants at the Bellagio Workshop

Alexander Aleinikoff, The New School
Charlotte Alfred, Refugees Deeply
Rebecca Brubaker, United Nations University Centre for Policy Research
Damian Cardona Onses, United Nations Department of Public Information
Leonard Doyle, International Organization for Migration
Thomas Dworzak, Magnum photographer
Adrian Edwards, UNHCR
Tabish Khair, University of Aarhaus
Nattha Komolvadhin, Thai Public Broadcasting Service
Mirca Madianou, Goldsmith's, University of London
David M. Malone, Rector, United Nations University
Nasar Meer, University of Edinburgh
Sana Mustafa, Sana Mustafa Consulting LLC, New Voices for Refugees
Parvati Nair, United Nations University Institute on Globalization, Culture and Mobility
Francis Nyamnjoh, University of Cape Town
John Perivolaris, Walden University
Janina Pescinski, United Nations University Institute on Globalization, Culture and Mobility
Marcella Pizarro, journalist and media analyst
Manveen Rana, BBC Radio 4
Marielle Sander, United Nations Population Fund
Natalia Sawka, Krytyka Polityczna (Political Critique)
Deborah Seward, UN Regional Information Centre for Western Europe
Carlos Vargas-Silva, University of Oxford
Benjamin Thomas White, University of Glasgow

Endnotes

1. The authors would like to thank Emma Hutchinson (UNU-CPR) for her wonderful assistance, as well as all the UNU colleagues who provided feedback on previous drafts. They would also like to thank the participants at the Bellagio conference for sharing their knowledge and ideas, along with Camille Desmares for authoring the Addressing Xenophobia report that was tabled at the Bellagio conference, Gregory Beals for the rich documentary photography and life stories that he collected for this report, and Janina Pescinski for invaluable assistance and inputs along the way.

2. UNU's unique position as a UN entity with complete academic independence allowed it to play a facilitating role in this process, bringing together a wide range of actors to a common discussion. The recommendations emanating from this process are thus independent but calibrated for UN and partner uptake.

3. See http://refugeesmigrants.un.org/18-december-multi-stakeholder-hearing for an exception.

4. United Nations General Assembly. *New York Declaration for Refugees and Migrants: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly*, 3 October 2016, A/RES/71/1, www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/71/1

5. See: Together. United Nations, together.un.org/.

6. "Asylum in the EU Member States: Record number of over 1.2 million first time asylum seekers registered in 2015." Eurostat newsrelease. 4 March 2016, ec.europa.eu/eurostat/documents/2995521/7203832/3-04032016-AP-EN.pdf/

7. On the use of "crisis" see:

Park, Jeanne. "Europe's Migration Crisis." *Council on Foreign Relations*. September 2015, www.cfr.org/backgrounder/europes-migration-crisis.

Teitelbaum, Michael S. "The Truth about the Migrant Crisis." *Foreign Affairs.* September, 2015, www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/western-europe/2015-09-14/truth-about-migrant-crisis.;

On the use of water analogies, consider the following examples:

"L'Italie de nouveau submergée par les migrants." *Le Monde*. June 2015, www.lemonde.fr/europe/article/2015/06/08/l-italie-de-nouveau-submergee-par-les-migrants_4649243_3214.html.

Klingst, Martin. "Die Profiteure der Einwanderungsangst." *Zeit Online*. March 2015, www.zeit.de/politik/ausland/2015-03/zuwanderung-fluechtlinge-pegida-asyl.;

A *New York Times* article quoted Le Pen stating that the migrants would "submerge" France, see: Nossiter, Adam. "For Marine Le Pen, Migration is a Ready-Made Issue." *The New York Times*. October 2015, www.nytimes.com/2015/10/06/world/europe/for-marine-le-pen-migration-is-a-ready-made-issue.html.

8. On the use of "swarms" by former UK Prime Minister Cameron see:

Elgot, Jessica and Matthew Taylor. "Calais crisis: Cameron condemned for 'dehumanising' description of migrants." *The Guardian*. July 2015, www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2015/jul/30/david-cameron-migrant-swarm-language-condemned;

On Le Pen's use of "barbarians" see:

"Le Pen compares migrant influx to barbarian invasion of Rome." *RT*. September 2015, www.rt.com/news/315466-le-pen-migrant-barbarian-invasion/.

9. Hopkins, K. "Rescue boats? I'd use gunships to stop migrants," *The Sun*, 17th April 2015]. The article has since been removed, but can be found here. For a discussion of its contents see, for example:

Plunkett, John. "Katie Hopkins: Sun migrants article petitions passes 200,000 mark." *The Guardian*. April 2015, www.theguardian.com/media/2015/apr/20/katie-hopkins-sun-migrants-article-petition-nears-180000-mark.

10. *World Migration Report 2018*. Edited by Marie McAuliffe and Martin Ruhs. International Organization for Migration (IOM). 2017, publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/wmr_2018_en.pdf. The statistics on "migrants" cited here follow IOM's convention of including refugees within the umbrella category of migrations. See https://www.iom.int/key-migration-terms for more information on how IOM defines terms used both generally and in their 2018 World Migration Report.

11. It has risen from just 2.3% to 3.3% between 1970 and today.

"Chapter Two: Migration and Migrants: A Global Overview." *World Migration Report 2018*. Edited by Marie McAuliffe and Martin Ruhs. IOM. 2017, pp.15 (Table 1) publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/wmr_2018_en_chapter2.pdf.

12. Edmond, Charlotte. "84% of refugees live in developing countries." *World Economic Forum*. June 2017, www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/06/eighty-four-percent-of-refugees-live-in-developing-countries/.

See also UNHCR's statistics on this issue:

"Which countries host the most refugees?" *UNHCR*. February 2017, www.unhcr.org/news/videos/2017/2/58b3f4714/which-countries-host-the-most-refugeesquest.html.;

"Poorer countries host most of the forcibly displaced, report shows." *UNHCR*. February 2017, www.unhcr.org/afr/news/latest/2017/2/58b001ab4/poorer-countries-host-forcibly-displaced-report-shows.html.

13. Scholars' presentations at the Bellagio Workshop. See also "Addressing Xenophobia: Representations of Migration and the Role of the Media." *United Nations University – Institute on Globalization, Culture and Mobility*. 2017.

14. Munro, Jonathan. "Why the BBC uses the word 'migrant.'" *BBC World Service*. August 2015, www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p030bn5m.

15. In order to be considered an internationally recognized "refugee" and thus to qualify for the rights that entails, an individual must be a) outside his or her country of origin, b) have a well-founded fear of persecution based on his/her race, religion, ethnicity, political

opinion, nationality or membership in a particular social group and c) unwilling or unable to avail him or herself of the protection of his/her own state (see CSR '51 and accompanying '67 protocol).

16. Taylor, Adam. "Is it time to ditch the word 'migrant'?" *The Washington Post*. August 2015, www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2015/08/24/is-it-time-to-ditch-the-word-migrant/?utm_term=.751c2de57367.;

Sengupta, Somini. "Migrant or Refugee? There Is a Difference, With Legal Implications." *The New York Times*. August 2015, www.nytimes.com/2015/08/28/world/migrants-refugees-europe-syria.html.;

See also:

Ruz, Camila. "The battle over the words used to describe migrants." *BBC News Magazine*. August 2015, www.bbc.com/news/magazine-34061097.;

Marsh, David. "We deride them as 'migrants'. Why not call them people?" *The Guardian*. August 2015, www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/aug/28/migrants-people-refugees-humanity.;

The Editorial Board. "Time to Retire the Term 'Alien.'" *The New York Times*. October 2015, www.nytimes.com/2015/10/20/opinion/time-to-retire-the-term-alien.html.

17. Malone, Barry. "Why Al Jazeera will not say Mediterranean 'migrants.'" *Al Jazeera*. August 2015, www.aljazeera.com/blogs/editors-blog/2015/08/al-jazeera-mediterranean-migrants-150820082226309.html.

18. For analysis of this debate see:

"Refugees or Migrants?" *On the Media*, Sept. 11th, 2015. https://www.wnyc.org/story/on-the-media-2015-09-11/

19. At Munich train station:

"Crowds Welcome Thousands of Exhausted Refugees at Munich Train Station." *NBC News*. September 2015, www.nbcnews.com/nightly-news/video/crowds-welcome-thousands-of-exhausted-refugees-at-munich-train-station-520727619603.

Along the journey:

"A New Life in Europe: The Dhnie Family." *BBC Radio 4*. www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p037lrj7/episodes/downloads.

20. *Refugees Deeply*. News Deeply. 2018, www.newsdeeply.com/refugees. Accessed 22 January 2018.

21. Consider the following examples:

Crisp, Jeff. "Refugees: the Trojan horse of terrorism?" *openDemocracy*. June 2017, www.opendemocracy.net/can-europe-make-it/jeff-crisp/refugees-trojan-horse-of-terrorism. Accessed 22 January 2018.

Smale, Alison. "Terrorism Suspects Are Posing as Refugees, Germany Says. *The New York Times*. February 2016, www.nytimes.com/2016/02/06/world/europe/germany-refugees-isis.html. Accessed 22 January 2018.

Jubilut, Liliana Lyra. "Refugees are not the creators of the crisis. They are the victims." *World Economic Forum*. November 2017, www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/11/the-refugee-crisis-or-a-crisis-for-refugees/. Accessed 22 January 2018.

Rose, Steve. "'They're usually either enemies or victims': the refugee crisis on screen." *The Guardian*. December 2017, www.theguardian.com/film/2017/dec/01/theyre-usually-either-enemies-or-victims-the-refugee-crisis-on-screen. Accessed 22 January 2018.

22. "Chapter Eight: Media Reporting of Migrants and Migration." *World Migration Report 2018*. Edited by Marie McAuliffe and Martin Ruhs. IOM. 2017, p. 200.

23. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017.

24. "Chapter Eight." *World Migration Report 2018*. IOM, 2017, pp. 196-197.

25. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, p. 9.

26. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, pp. 9-10.

27. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, p. 5 and p. 9.

28. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, p. 10.

29. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, p. 8.

30. "Chapter Eight." *World Migration Report 2018*. IOM, 2017, p. 205.

31. Some of these other factors include: demographic shifts, economic austerity policies, the rise of support for fringe political parties in Europe, levels of unemployment, interaction with cultural media such as books and TV shows, and degree of exposure among other factors. See for example:

Global Migration Data Analysis Centre (GMDAC). "How the World Views Migration." *IOM*. 2015, publications.iom.int/system/files/how_the_world_gallup.pdf.

32. "Chapter Eight." *World Migration Report* 2018. IOM, 2017, p. 195).

"Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, p. 10.

33. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017, p. 3, p. 5. For example, consider the Dhnie family, featured in the *BBC 4* podcast series, "A New Life in Europe." Although forced to sleep on the pavement, go for days without a shower, and seek digestive relief in an open field, the report also highlights the fact that the family had enjoyed the same middle-class lifestyle as many voters in Europe, prior to the war in Syria. Moreover, the podcast reveals that the Dhnie family's oldest daughter, Alma, is determined to make it to Germany and learn German so that she can finish her medical studies (from which she had been barred) and then serve as a doctor in her future country, highlighting a willingness to contribute towards her new country. The research on migration generally backs up such portrayals, suggesting that those who have greater means, education, or job skills are more likely to have the ability to either migrate or to flee in the first place. As a result, the gap between the new arrivals and those receiving them is often smaller than more simplified or stereotypical reporting would make it seem. Similarly, the research also generally shows that while newcomers, like perhaps Alma and her family, for example, do add an initial strain on a destination country's economy, in the mid- and long term they help stimulate growth through the incorporation of their labour and existing skills sets into the host community.

34. Mirca Madianou writes of how the media shapes social respities in her book *Mediating the Nation*, 2012. London: Routledge.

35. Consider the BBC's "one minute world news", the *Economist's* Expresso news app, and Twitter.

36. For US trust in news media see: https://www.npr.org/sections/ombudsman/2017/05/15/528158488/looking-to-the-future-restoring-public-trust-in-the-media

Rates of mistrust regarding migration coverage were discussed over the course of the conference.

37. Discussed during the conference.

38. See pre-Workshop report, Addressing Xenophobia for more on this topic. "Addressing Xenophobia." 2017.

39. UNHCR, OHCHR, IOM, UN-DESA, DPI, UNU are all already engaging in such exercises, as are MSF, ICRC, and IRC.

40. See "Addressing Xenophobia" pp. 13-pp. 14 for a more extensive discussion of the principles guiding media coverage. Which include; accuracy, stereotypes, us/them distinction, terminology, tone of coverage, and protecting the identity of refugees and migrants.

41. "A New Life in Europe: The Dhnie Family." *BBC Radio 4*. www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p037lrj7/episodes/downloads.

42. Addario, Lynsey; Baker, Aryn and Francesca Trianni. *Finding Home*. Time, time.com/finding-home-stories/.

43. Viner, Katharine. "The Long Read: A mission for journalism in a time of crisis." *The Guardian*. November 2017, www.theguardian.com/news/2017/nov/16/a-mission-for-journalism-in-a-time-of-crisis.

A few segments are devoted to migrants and refugees, in particular:

Einashe, Ismail. "The Long Read: The struggle to be British: my life as a second-class citizen". The Guardian. March 2017, www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2017/mar/02/struggle-british-life-as-second-class-citizen.

Also:

Nayeri, Dina, "The Long Read: The ungrateful refugee: 'We have no debt to repay." *The Guardian*. April 2017, www.theguardian.com/world/2017/apr/04/dina-nayeri-ungrateful-refugee.

44. "Fear and Loathing in Homer and Rockville." *This American Life*. 21 July 2017, www.thisamericanlife.org/radio-archives/episode/621/fear-and-loathing-in-homer-and-rockville.

45. "Refugee Voices: Refugees tell their own stories." *Refugees Deeply*. www.newsdeeply.com/refugees/refugee-voices.;

"Crisis & Conflicts: Exploring the conflicts and political crises that cause refugees to flee and impact their treatment in host countries." *Refugees Deeply*. www.newsdeeply.com/refugees/crises-conflict.

46. Magnum Photographers. "Book-Europa." *Magnum Photos Pro*. pro.magnumphotos.com/Package/2K1HRGPLN0EM.

47. McVeigh, Tracy. "Bins in Berlin to ATMs in Antwerp: a guide to Europe for refugees – photo essay." *The Guardian*. July 2017, www.theguardian.com/global-development/2017/jul/17/guidebook-refugees-magnum-photographers-introduce-europe.

48. See "Addressing Xenophobia" pp. 13-14 for a more extensive discussion.

49. These recommendations are based both on the UNU's Pre-Conference Report 'Addressing Xenophobia' and on the discussion during the 2017 Bellagio Workshop.

50. Al Jazeera's the Listening Post is an example of news programming that helps build media literacy and critical awareness See:

The Listening Post. Al Jazeera. 2018. www.aljazeera.com/programmes/listeningpost/.