Conflict Prevention and Horizontal Inequalities
-What mechanism reduces the likelihood of armed conflicts in Zambia?-  

Mizuki Watanabe

2nd Year, International Public Policy  
Graduate School of Public Policy, the University of Tokyo  
Host University: The University of Zambia  
The period of research: 2 months

I. Summary

This study examines the degree of Horizontal Inequalities (HIs) of Zambia. The low degree of HIs in Zambia is said to be one of the factors that has been preventing conflicts over the last 50 years. HIs are defined as inequalities among groups of people that share a common identity (Stewart, 2010). Such inequalities have four main dimensions: Political HIs, Economic HIs, Social HIs and Cultural HIs. Recent studies of civil war argue that the existence of HIs increases the risk of conflict in a multi-ethnic country. Stewart et al. argue that conflict is more likely where political and socio-economic HIs are high and run in the same direction (Stewart et al., 2008). Evidence on the significance of HIs for conflict is drawn from both case studies and econometric investigations (Stewart, 2010).

In order to measure a degree of HIs in each dimension, an inquiring survey with particular focus on the relatively large four ethnic groups of Zambia: Bemba, Nyanja, Tonga and Lozi was conducted through the field work involving interviews. I focused on ethnic groups among identified ones since they have often been recognized in the context of conflict.

---

1 Frances (2010) introduces a number of elements in each four dimension:
- Economic HIs: inequalities in access to and ownership of assets—financial, human, natural resource-based and social, and also inequalities in income levels and employment opportunities, which depend on such assets and the general conditions of the economy.
- Social HIs: inequalities in access to a range of services, such as education, healthcare and housing, as well as to the benefits of educational and health care outcomes.
- Political HIs: inequalities in the distribution of political opportunities and power among groups, including control over the army, the cabinet, local and regional governments, parliamentary assemblies, the police and the presidency. They also encompass inequalities in people’s capabilities to participate politically and to express their needs.
- Cultural status HIs: disparities in the recognition and standing of different groups’ language, religion, customs, norms and practices.

2 E.g, Rwanda; Sudan; Kenya; N.Ireland; Peru; Guatemala; Nigeria. Many more case studies are to be found in Stewart 2008, and CRISE Working Papers (www.crise.ox.ac.uk)
The survey result shows that the majority of respondents have not felt a sense of inequality among ethnic-divided groups and the percentage of people who perceive HIs in Zambia is low. The answers were provided by all of randomly-selected 215 respondents, however, of course it does not mean that their answers represent what the whole of people in Zambia think. Still, I believe this survey result indicates a worthwhile tendency of HIs in Zambia.

I would like to mention two points that differentiate this research from previous studies. First, it focuses on a country which has never experienced armed conflict. Previous studies usually measured degrees of HIs in a country that has experienced severe ethnic conflict such as Côte d’Ivoire, Ghana and Nigeria. If HIs in countries which have never experienced any conflicts are low, we can point out the correlation between the existence of HIs and the possibility of conflict occurring.

Second, this research tries to focus on the ‘self-perceived’ HIs, while previous researches have mainly dealt with the ‘examined’ HIs drawn by the statistical data such as Demographic Health Survey (DHS). A systematic, large-N quantitative research is necessary for conducting comparative analysis, however, I would like to argue that such kinds of data sometimes fail to specify the identified groups and cover limited kinds of dimensions of HIs. Taking an example of DHS, it merely provides socio-economic data of each region. Additionally, the perceived HIs are very important since conflict is more likely where collective grievances are generated by perception of inequalities among people. For these reasons, I believe measuring the perceived HIs is nothing but meaningful for conflict studies at a case-study level.

In the last of this report, I would like to discuss two mechanisms which possibly work on decreasing HIs of Zambia for the further research.
格差に焦点を置いていた。いくつかの紛争未経験国で水平的格差が低いということが確認された場合、水平的格差の有無と紛争発生の相関関係がより強固となると考えられ、本研究はその一端を成すものである。

二つ目は、「認識される」水平的格差に焦点を当てたことである。これまでの先行研究は、Demographic Health Survey（DHS）といった統計資料を用い、「実際の」水平的格差について分析を行うことが多かった。統計資料は比較分析をする際に有用であるが、水平的格差の全ての次元を把握できないこと、集団の特定が困難であることなどの問題点を抱えている。また、人々が不平等を認知することにより不平感情が発生することが紛争に大きく起因していることからも、認識される格差に焦点を当てることが、少なくともケース・スタディレベルでは望ましいと考える。本研究では各民族集団への聞き取り調査を通じて、人々がどのように水平的格差を認識しているかを測ることを試みた。

本レポートの最後では、調査の結果をもとに、ザンビアにて水平的格差を低く抑えているメカニズムに関する考察を行い、今後の研究に繋げていく。

II. Research Activity
1. Introduction
   Why do some multi-ethnic countries experience violent conflict while other multi-ethnic countries enjoy peaceful societies? Civil wars often have an ethnic dimension, with well-defined identity groups fighting each other (Murshed, S. Mansoob & Scott Gates, 2005) and many countries in Africa have experienced so-called ethnic conflicts in the 1990s. Recent studies of civil war argue that the existence of Horizontal Inequalities increases the risk of conflict in a multi-ethnic country.

   According to large-N studies of civil war (e.g. Collier & Hoeffler, 2004; Fearon & Laitin, 2003; Hegre, Gissinger & Gleditsch, 2003), inequality does not necessarily raise the risk of violent conflict (Østby, 2008). However, as Østby argues (2008), these studies test the conflict potential of vertical inequalities, which are the inequalities among individuals, opposed to horizontal inequalities between social groups. Since many armed conflicts are deeply stemmed from collective grievance shared among group members, what is important is the group aspect of inequality and we cannot neglect Horizontal Inequalities.

   Horizontal Inequalities (HIs) are inequalities among groups of people that share a common identity (Stewart, 2002) and can provide a cause of conflict between groups with different identities. In this research, I investigated a degree of HIs in Zambia, with a hypothesis that the degree of HIs among ethnic groups in Zambia is low, so that Zambia has never experienced the armed conflict among ethnic groups since its independence.

   One example of HIs drawn by DHS is proof of why I paid attention to a degree of HIs in Zambia. The figure 1 shows the rate of under-5 child mortality per 1000 live birth in four countries: Côte d’Ivoire, Ghana, Nigeria and Zambia. The column presents the average rate of under-5 child mortality in each country, and the error bar displays the difference of the rate among each province in each country. These countries were roughly ethnically divided by each province, thus we can approximately guess the
degree of HIs of each ethnic group from the result of DHS. Comparing the length of each error bar, we can assume that Zambia is one of the countries whose degree of HIs is relatively low compared to countries which have experienced civil conflicts in the past.

Figure 1: HIs: the rate of under-5 child mortality (per 1000 live birth)


2. Study Area

I chose Zambia as the case study, because Zambia is one of the rare African countries which have never experienced a severe armed conflict among ethnic groups. If some mechanisms for conflict prevention are found, it would also be possibly adapted to other countries which suffered from violent conflict and its relapses. The survey was held in Lusaka province and Southern province, where two big cities of Zambia, Lusaka (capital) and Livingstone (the second large city) are located.

3. Methodology

Interviews were conducted in compounds (the district for the poor), schools and town (the main street of each city) in Southern province from February 22\textsuperscript{nd} to 23\textsuperscript{rd} and in Lusaka province from March 14\textsuperscript{th} to 24\textsuperscript{th}. The questionnaire items were 16 in total (Appendix A). This structured interview focused in particular on four ethnic groups: Bemba, Chewa, Tonga and Lozi, which are relatively large ethnic groups in Zambia (Appendix B). Two Zambian assistants who spoke the above languages and translated survey to the language in which each respondent\textsuperscript{3} speaks.

In the questionnaire, two elements were employed in each four HIs dimension to measure the degree of HIs as described below. Respondents were asked to express how they perceive the degree of HIs in each dimension.

\textsuperscript{3} For the breakdown of respondents, see appendix B
• Political HIs: The proportion of National assembly and Cabinet
• Economic HIs: Earning and Employment
• Social HIs: Education and social service
• Cultural HIs: The feeling of being marginalized by language and tribe

4. Research Findings
This section introduces the degree of Horizontal Inequalities of Zambia in four dimensions which is led by the result of the inquiring survey⁴.

Figure 2

Speaking of political HIs, the majority of respondents regards their ethnic groups are represented in the National Assembly of Zambia and Cabinet with a considerable proportions, while the majority of Lozi respondents and 34% of Tonga respondents states that they feel unequal at the Cabinet level (See the section of political HIs in Appendix C).

Figure 3

The majority feels equal in economic HIs as well, while 40% of Lozi respondents stated that they feel grievances against other ethnic groups at workplace and 53% of Tonga respondents stated that they feel richer than other groups, which is 1.28 times higher than the average (See the section of economic HIs in Appendix C).

⁴ Appendix C shows the proportion of each ethnic group’s Horizontal inequalities in four dimensions
When it comes to Social HIs, approximately three quarters of respondents stated that they feel equal in the social dimension and each ethnic group think they are treated equally (See the section of social HIs in Appendix C).

The last is cultural HIs. The result shows that most of the respondents have never felt the sense of being marginalized by their tribe and their language, while 53% of Tonga respondents have experienced the marginalization by linguistic and 45% of them also have felt that by tribe (See the section of cultural HIs in Appendix C)
Table 6: Summary of HIs variables of all respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Bemba</th>
<th>Chewa</th>
<th>Tonga</th>
<th>Lozi</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Political</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parliament</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cabinet</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tribe</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Equal
- Equal but % of inequality is high
- Unequal

Table 6 sums up HIs variables of four focused ethnic groups, in comparison with the average of those of the others as well as of all respondents. Overall, the majority of respondents stated that they have not felt the sense of inequality in each dimension of HIs and it leads the conclusion of this survey that the HIs perceived by people are not significant in Zambia.

5. Discussion

The survey demonstrates a relatively low degree of HIs in Zambia, still its reasons are not clearly uncovered. I would like to suggest two hypotheses here for the further discussion.

One is that the sense of national identity prevents the ethnic polarization. It could be thought that this makes Zambian people feel equal. In the survey, I asked to the respondent ‘Which identification sounds comfortable the most when you are identify yourself?’ Figure 7 below indicates the proportion of answers by each respondent.

According to the graph, 60% of the respondents identify themselves as Zambian, which is 2.4 times as large as people regarding themselves as tribal members (25%).

The founding norm “one Zambia, one nation” declared by Kenneth Kaunda, the first president of Zambia who ruled the country more than 25 years, seems to be effective even 50 years after the independence. Some respondents mentioned this norm as a reason why they have never felt
the sense of being marginalized as on account of their language identity or tribe.

The second hypothesis, somehow related to the first one, is that political institutions of Zambia have continued to make a considerable effort to decrease the level of inequalities. Kenneth Kaunda took great care to balance his cabinet appointments across ethnic groups (Posner, 2005). Considering the fact that the regional HI measures are interacted with terms for regime type; electoral system and political exclusion (Østby, 2008), what Kaunda worked out seems to be important to decrease the degree of HIs in this country.

6. Conclusion

The correlation between HIs and conflict was emphasized by this field survey examining the degree of HIs in Zambia. Overall, the majority of interviewed respondents stated that they have not felt the sense of inequality in each dimension of HIs. Especially for public policy students, I believe that it is very important to search for some instrumental methods to decrease HIs in a country which can be adopted to other countries.

I would like to continue my research about HIs and conflict prevention from now on in order to contribute to post-conflict countries suffering from violent conflict and its relapses in Africa.

• Acknowledgement

I would like to express my deepest appreciation to all those who provided me the possibility to complete this survey. A special gratitude I give to: UNU-IAS: Dr. Osamu Saito, Dr. Natsuko Imai, UNZA: Prof. Momba, Dr. Jewette Masinja, Miss. Kabwe Musonda, Miss. Sumbwanyambe Likando, Mr. Kalaluka Mututwa.

• References

  o Gleditsch, Kristian Skrede et al., 2014, Data and progress in peace and conflict research, Journal of Peace Research
  o Ogura, Mitsuo et al., 2012, Contemporary African Societies and International Relations, Ushindo
  o Østby, Gudrun, 2008, Polarization, Horizontal Inequalities and Violent Civil Conflict, Journal of Peace Research
• Stewart, Frances et al., 2005, Why Horizontal Inequalities Matter: Some Implications for Measurement, CRISE Working Paper No.19
• Stewart, Frances et al., 2008, Horizontal inequalities and conflict, Understanding Group Violence in Multiethnic Societies
• Stewart, Frances, 2010, Horizontal Inequalities as a cause of conflict - A Review of CRISE Findings, WORLD DEVELOPMENT REPORT 2011

• Appendix
  Appendix A: Questionnaire
Please circle the number of each answer for the questions below.

Age: (     )  Sex: (Male / Female)

Q1. In Which province did you spend the most of time in your life?
   2. Western  6. Central  10. Luapula
   3. Southern  7. Lusaka
   0. Outside of Zambia (*Please Specify:           )

Q2. How many years have you lived in the above-mentioned province?  (     ) years

Q3. What is the highest education you have finished?
   (Primary / Junior / Secondary / Upper Secondary / College / University / Graduate school / Other (*Please Specify:            )

Q4. What is your tribe based on your ID card?
   2. Chewa  5. Nsenga  8. Lala
   3. Lozi  6. Tumbuka
   0. Other (*Please Specify:            )

Q5. What is your mother tongue except English?
   0. Other (*Please Specify:            )

Q6. Which identification sounds the most comfortable when you are asked to identify yourself as:
   1. Your linguistic group  5. Your current town
   2. Your ethnicity  6. Your hometown
   3. Your tribe  7. Zambian
   4. Your province
   0. Other (*Please Specify:            )

Q7. Have you ever felt the sense of being marginalized as on account of your language identity by other linguistic groups?
   1. Yes  2. No  0. Not sure

Please explain whatever you answered. For example: When did you feel it / why didn’t?

Q8. Have you ever felt the sense of being marginalized as on account of your tribe by other groups?
   1. Yes  2. No  0. Not sure

Please explain whatever you answered. For example: When did you feel it / why didn’t?

Q9. Have you ever felt the sense of inequalities / grievances against people in other linguistic groups?
   1. Yes  2. No  0. Not sure
Answer this question if you answered Yes to Q9, against which linguistic group have you felt that feeling?
0. Other (*Please Specify: )

Please explain whatever you answered. For example: When did you feel it / why didn’t?

Q10. Have you ever felt the sense of inequalities / grievances against people in other tribes?
1. Yes    2. No    0. Not sure

Answer this question if you answered Yes to Q 10, against which tribe have you felt that feeling?
2. Chewa    5. Nsenga    8. Lala
3. Lozi    6. Tumbuka
0. Other (*Please Specify: )
Please explain whatever you answered. For example: When did you feel it / why didn’t?

Q11. Do you think your ethnic group has the same opportunity as other groups in the provision of education?
1. Yes, we are treated as equal as other groups.
2. To be honest, our group sometimes has a privilege compared to other groups.
3. No, we feel some grievances against other groups.
0. Not Sure

Q12. Do you think your ethnic group is successfully represented at the National Assembly of Zambia with a considerable proportion?
1. Yes, the proportion of our group is considerable.
2. No, the proportion of our group is over-represented.
3. No, the proportion of our group is under-represented.
0. Not Sure

Q13. Do you think your ethnic group is successfully represented among Ministers, deputy Ministers and other senior political appointments with a considerable proportion?
1. Yes, the proportion of our group is considerable.
2. No, the proportion of our group is over-represented.
3. No, the proportion of our group is under-represented.
0. Not Sure

Q14. Do you think your ethnic group is richer (meaning, you earn much money) than other groups in general? Just tell me your honest thought.
1. Yes, I think our group is richer than other groups.
2. I think it’s almost the same amount as other groups.
3. No, we are poorer than other groups.
0. Not Sure

Q15. Do you think your ethnic group is treated as equal as the other groups at the employment, speaking of opportunities, salary and promotions?
1. Yes, we are treated as equal as other groups.
2. To be honest, our group sometimes has a privilege compared to other groups.
3. No, we feel some grievances against other groups.
0. Not Sure

Q16. Do you think your ethnic group is treated as equal as the other groups at social services such as Health
Care, Welfare, Pensions and Insurance?
1. Yes, we are treated as equal as other groups.
2. To be honest, our group sometimes has a privilege compared to other groups.
3. No, we feel some grievances against other groups.
0. Not Sure

Thank you very much for participating in our survey!

Appendix B: The breakdown of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Respondent: 215</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Education level</th>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10s</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20s</td>
<td>95</td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30s</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40s</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Upper Secondary</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50s</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>College</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over 60</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brank</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Graduate School</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brank</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>No Education</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brank</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brank</td>
<td></td>
<td>Brank</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix B: The proportion of each ethnic group's Horizontal inequalities in four dimensions

<Political Horizontal Inequalities>

• National Assembly

Q. What do you think of the proportion of your ethnic group at the National Assembly of Zambia?

The majority are content, while 30% of Lozi and 32% of Tonga think they are under-represented at parliament

• Cabinet
Q. What do you think of the proportion of your ethnic group at Ministers, deputy Ministers and other senior political appointments?

The majority of Bemba and Chewa are satisfied, while the majority of Lozi and 34% of Tonga feel inequality at Cabinet.

< Economic Horizontal Inequalities >

- Employment

Q. Do you think your ethnic group is treated as equal as the other groups at the employment, speaking of opportunities, salary and promotions?

The majority feel they are treated equally, while 40% of Lozi feel some grievances.

- Earning

Q. Do you think your ethnic group is richer (meaning, you earn much money) than other groups in general? Just tell me your honest thought.

The majority feel equal. The proportion of Tonga people who think they have a privilege is 1.3 times higher than that of average.

<Social Horizontal Inequalities>

- Education
Q. Do you think your ethnic group has the same opportunity as other groups in the provision of education?

- Social Services

Q. Do you think your ethnic group is treated as equal as the other groups at social services such as Health Care, Welfare, Pensions and Insurance?

<Cultural Horizontal Inequalities>

- Language

Q. Have you ever felt the sense of being marginalized by your language?

- Tribe
III. Reflection to the GLTP in Africa

- My motivation to participate in the GLTP

  I can still remember the feeling of excitement when I received an offer letter from the UNU nominating me as one of the participants of GLTP.

  I was looking for opportunities to step into the continent of Africa and GLTP gave me this great chance. Before participating in GLTP, everything I had known about Africa came from written forms such as journals and books, even though my undergraduate major was African Politics. GLTP enabled me to finally see the real Africa through field experiences.

- Field experiences

  At first, my inquiring survey was supposed to be conducted on campus. The university of Zambia seemed a very good field where I could encounter people from various ethnic groups who came from different provinces. Unfortunately, I realized my plan should be modified since the school was closed because of students' riot on the third day after arriving in Zambia and all of undergraduate were gone. I urgently needed to find another field in order to collect the feasible number of answers from major four ethnic groups and finish my research in two months.

  After having a discussion with my supervisor at the University of Zambia, I decided to visit several compounds (the slum district where the poor households live) in Lusaka province and Southern province with two Zambian assistants who can speak several major local languages. In compounds, I met a lot of people who were able to communicate only in their local language and my assistants helped me a lot throughout the survey.
It seemed like an Asian girl walking down the compound district was a rare situation for local people, which worked in a good way. I was usually greeted warmly and friendly and many of them willingly participate in this survey. Some people even invited us to their houses. The field inquiring survey was nothing but a very good opportunity not only for my research but also for experiencing a very local Zambian life through communicating with local people.

Two assistants (Mr. Mututwa and Miss. Likando)

- **Challenges**

  Above-mentioned riot was definitely one of the great challenges for my research. Another thing is the data I was looking for were not available in the institutions of Zambia. At first, I was planning to measure the degree of Horizontal inequality (See the section I and II) by comparing actual HIs (data) to perceived HIs (inquiring survey). I refrain to mention the specific name of institutions here, but for several reasons, I could not access the data and needed to focus on the perceived HIs in this research.

  Speaking of the daily life, everything was perfect except load shedding for over eight hours happening almost every day, which means candle light dinner was no longer rare! Most of all Zambian electricity relied on hydro-electric production. Scarce rainfall made water levels at the dam significantly low and that led this massive load shedding this year.

- **How to make use of this experience to my future career development**

  My future dream is to contribute to peace-building in post-conflict countries of Africa as an advocacy staff of the international organization. During my stay in Zambia, I think I was able to obtain two important skills which I can possibly make use of in the future.

  One is the high communication skill with people with whom I am not familiar. In the field survey, I randomly talked to
people walking down the street to get the number of responses as many as possible. There was no time to be shy in front of strangers during the survey, which fostered my sociability.

Another is the flexibility for continuously changing situations. I met several unexpected difficult situations (the riot thing, the data collection and more!) during my research in Zambia, however, I always made efforts to find alternatives and fit myself into the situation. I believe these two skills will be very helpful when I start to work for an international organization in Africa.

- Encouragement to other students

If you are interested in visiting Africa as part of your research, GLTP is one of the best programs assisting you! Thanks to kind and warm staffs at the University of Zambia, staying in Zambia for two months became absolutely one of the most precious experiences in my life. I would like to recommend this program to all graduate students in Japan whose research project is related to Africa.